



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a new manuscript submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Thu, Feb 16, 2023 at 12:45 PM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens

Author(s): Habib Adjie

Corresponding Author: Habib Adjie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Narotama, Surabaya, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 16-January-2023 (UTC)

In a couple of days, a confirmation email including the manuscript ID will be again forwarded to you when the journal manager looks through your submission and confirms it. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Thu, Feb 16, 2023 at 2:59 PM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens

Author(s): Habib Adjie

Corresponding Author: Habib Adjie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Narotama, Surabaya, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 16-January-2023 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-672-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

*International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Mon, Mar 27, 2023 at 12:53 AM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.

Reviewer- A

Decision: Major revisions required

The authors set a stage for the research effectively , but it can be improved by providing more specific details about the challenges faced by foreigners in land ownership in Indonesia and by clarifying the research objectives and significance . Additionally , ensure proper citations and a clear structure for the paper.

1. Explicitly state the research gap or problem that the study addresses . What is the specific issue or question you are trying to answer in your research ?This should be clearly articulated to provide context for the reader.
2. The methodology section is well -structured and provides a clear explanation of the research methods used. However, consider using subheadings to break down the different research methods you employed , such as "Data Collection "and "Data Analysis ,"to make it even more organized and reader -friendly . You've justified your choice of qualitative research methods, which is appropriate for your research objective. However, you might want to briefly explain why you chose content analysis as the specific analytical method for your study. What advantages does it offer in the context of your research?
3. While you've mentioned some limitations of your research in the results section, it's a good practice to also include limitations in the methodology section. This helps readers understand the potential shortcomings of your approach right from the beginning.
4. The results section is well -organized , with subsections that help readers navigate through the findings . This makes it easier for readers to locate specific information within the results . As discuss different laws and regulations related to land ownership for foreigners , consider providing citations for these legal documents or regulations . This will add credibility to your findings and allow readers to verify

the information if needed.

5. Your recommendations are clear and well-organized . However , it might be helpful to provide specific examples or actionable steps for each recommendation . For instance, when suggesting that the legal framework should clarify the conditions for foreign ownership in residential and business properties , you could provide examples of how this could be achieved or what specific changes might be needed in the existing laws.

Reviewer -B**Decision: Major revisions required**

The manuscript and ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens is a well written and timely addressed topic. However, it could be more concise with following suggestion.

1. You mention that "the legal framework poses numerous regulatory barriers for foreigners,"but it would be helpful to provide specific examples or key findings from your research in the abstract.
2. The introduction provides some historical background on Indonesian land ownership laws , which is useful . However , you could enhance it by briefly explaining the specific challenges or issues that foreigners face when trying to own land in Indonesia . This would give readers a clearer understanding of the problem your research aims to address.
3. Explicitly state the objectives or goals of your research in the introduction. What are you trying to achieve with this study?This will help set the context for the reader.
4. When referencing prior research or laws, make sure to include proper citations (e.g., APA, A) to give credit to the original sources and to provide readers with the opportunity to explore these references if they want more detail.
5. The transition from the historical background to the present situation could be smoother . Consider using transitional phrases or sentences to guide the reader from one point to another.

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Tue, Apr 25, 2023 at 1:23 PM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens

Author(s): Habib Adjie

Corresponding Author: Habib Adjie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Narotama, Surabaya, Indonesia

Date of Manuscript Submission: 16-January-2023 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-672-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your revision submission for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewer 1

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	<p>The authors set a stage for the research effectively, but it can be improved by providing more specific details about the challenges faced by foreigners in land ownership in Indonesia and by clarifying the research objectives and significance. Additionally, ensure proper citations and a clear structure for the paper.</p>	<p>Many thanks respected reviewer for your kind remarks and suggestions.</p>
1	<p>Explicitly state the research gap or problem that the study addresses. What is the specific issue or question you are trying to answer in your research? This should be clearly articulated to provide context for the reader.</p>	<p>Many thanks for your kind suggestions. We have now stated the research gap or problem that the study addresses and also reported specific question. Please see pages 4-5</p>
2	<p>The methodology section is well-structured and provides a clear explanation of the research methods used. However, consider using subheadings to break down the different research methods you employed, such as "Data Collection" and "Data Analysis," to make it even more organized and reader friendly. You've justified your choice of qualitative research methods, which is appropriate for your research objective. However, you might want to briefly explain why you chose content analysis as the specific analytical method for your study. What advantages does it offer in the context of your research?</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, following your kind guidelines. Done as suggested. Please see pages 12-13</p>

3	<p>While you've mentioned some limitations of your research in the results section, it's a good practice to also include limitations in the methodology section. This helps readers understand the potential shortcomings of your approach right from the beginning.</p>	<p>Dear reviewer, Thank you for your kind suggestions. done Please see pages 21-22</p>
4	<p>The results section is well-organized, with subsections that help readers navigate through the findings. This makes it easier for readers to locate specific information within the results. As you discuss different laws and regulations related to land ownership for foreigners, consider providing citations for these legal documents or regulations. This will add credibility to your findings and allow readers to verify the information if needed.</p>	<p>Respected reviewer, Thank you. Done as suggested Please see pages 14-17</p>
5	<p>Your recommendations are clear and well-organized. However, it might be helpful to provide specific examples or actionable steps for each recommendation. For instance, when suggesting that the legal framework should clarify the conditions for foreign ownership in residential and business properties, you could provide examples of how this could be achieved or what specific changes might be needed in the existing laws.</p>	<p>Thank you, dear reviewer. Done. Please see page no 18-19</p>

Response to Reviewer 2

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	The manuscript Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens is a well written and timely addressed topic. However, it could be more concise with following suggestion.	Thank you for your feedback on the paper. It's essential to provide constructive comments to help improve the quality of the paper. Here is the detailed response please.
1	You mention that "the legal framework poses numerous regulatory barriers for foreigners," but it would be helpful to provide specific examples or key findings from your research in the abstract.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see page 7-8,15
2	The introduction provides some historical background on Indonesian land ownership laws, which is useful. However, you could enhance it by briefly explaining the specific challenges or issues that foreigners face when trying to own land in Indonesia. This would give readers a clearer understanding of the problem your research aims to address.	Many thanks. done as suggested. Please see page 2-6
3	Explicitly state the objectives or goals of your research in the introduction. What are you trying to achieve with this study? This will help set the context for the reader.	Dear reviewer, done as suggested. Please see pages 5
4	When referencing prior research or laws, make sure to include proper citations (e.g., APA, MLA) to give credit to the original sources and to provide readers with the opportunity to explore these references if they want more detail.	Dear reviewer, Thank you. Done as suggested.

5	The transition from the historical background to the present situation could be smoother. Consider using transitional phrases or sentences to guide the reader from one point to another.	Done, dear reviewer as suggested. Please see page 10-12
---	---	--



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Wed, May 17, 2023 at 11:03 AM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*, "Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens".

Our decision is: **Revisions Required**

Please revise your manuscript based on the reviewers' comments and suggestions accordingly and resubmit your revised manuscript no later than one month. Let me know if you have any questions.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Acknowledgment of a manuscript revision submission

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Mon, Jun 12, 2023 at 1:39 PM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

Thank you for submitting the following manuscript revision to the *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences*.

Track: Regular Track
Title: Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens
Author(s): Habib Adjie
Corresponding Author: Habib Adjie
Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Narotama, Surabaya, Indonesia
Date of Manuscript Submission: 16-January-2023 (UTC)
The manuscript ID: IJCJS-672-2023

We have confirmed and forwarded your submission revision for reviewing process. Further progress on your submission can be checked through the following online system.

* Online System URL: <https://www.manuscriptlink.com/journals/ijcjs>

If you have any questions regarding your submission, please contact the journal editor-in-chief.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief
International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences
Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====
This email is only for the delivery service.
Please do not reply to this mail.

Response to Reviewers

Sr. No.	Reviewer's Comment	Response
	In this updated version although the discussion of theoretical implications effectively highlights the contributions of your study to the existing body of literature on land rights for foreign citizens in Indonesia. However,	Many thanks, Respected Reviewer. Thanks for you kind words.
1	Authors might want to mention whether your study suggests any new theoretical perspectives or models that future researchers could explore.	Many thanks, for kind comments. We have now mentioned new theoretical perspectives and models that future researchers could explore. Plesae see page 21-22
2	It's good that authors acknowledge the limitations of methodological choices. However, consider elaborating on how these limitations might have influenced your findings. For instance, how might the use of quantitative research methods have yielded different results or insights?	Dear reviewer, done as suggested by your kind self. Please see page 22



Habib Adjie <adjieku61@gmail.com>

[IJCJS] Editor Decision

IJCJS <no-reply@manuscriptlink.com>
To: "Habib Adjie" <adjieku61@gmail.com>

Sat, Jul 22, 2023 at 1:15 PM

Dear Dr. Habib Adjie,

Congratulations! the following of your manuscript.

Track: Regular Track

Title: Land ownership in Indonesia for foreign citizens

Author(s): Habib Adjie

Corresponding Author: Habib Adjie

Affiliation of Corresponding Author: Universitas Narotama, Surabaya,

Indonesia Date of Manuscript Submission: 16-January-2023 (UTC)

The manuscript ID: IJCJS-672-2023

Has been accepted for publication in *International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences* (Vol. 18 No. 2, 2023). Thank you for your interest in our journal. Your Journal paper would be indexed in Scopus (Elsevier), Google Scholar, Scirus, GetCited, Scribd, so on.

We look forward to receiving your subsequent research papers.

Best regards,

Journal Editor-in-Chief

International Journal of Criminal Justice Sciences

Homepage: <https://www.ijcjs.com>

=====[Note]=====

This email is only for the delivery service.

Please do not reply to this mail.